UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

ESTATE OF MANUEL ROSENBERG and
AUDRAY ROSENBERG,

Plaintiff,

v.

CIVIL ACTION NO. _____

MACY'S, INC., METLIFE, INC., AND BRIGHTHOUSE FINANCIAL

Defendants.

COMPLAINT

Introduction

- 1. Plaintiffs brings this lawsuit pursuant to the Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974, as amended ("ERISA"): (a) 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(1)(B), which authorizes a plan "participant or beneficiary" to bring a "civil action" to "recover benefits due . . . under the term of his plan;" (b) 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(2), which authorizes a participant or beneficiary to pursue claims for breach of fiduciary duty; and (c) 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(3) (ERISA's so-called "catch-all" provision) for equitable relief from breach of fiduciary duty. 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(3) provides that a civil action may be brought -
 - "(3) by a participant, beneficiary, or fiduciary (A) to enjoin any act or practice which violates any provision of this subchapter or the terms of the plan, or (B) to obtain other appropriate equitable relief (i) to redress such violations or (ii) to enforce any provisions of this subchapter or the terms of the plan."
- 2. In accord with 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(1)(B), Plaintiffs seek to obtain the benefits due arising from Defendants' failure to provide the benefits due under a 10 Year Certain & Life

Annuity purchased by Plaintiff Audray Rosenberg's husband, Mr. Rosenberg, prior to his death.

As a result of Defendants' cancellation of the 10 Year Certain & Life Annuity, Plaintiffs have suffered damages in an amount to be determined.

- 3. In cancelling the 10 Year Certain & Life Annuity, the plan fiduciaries breached their fiduciary duties under ERISA by failing (1) to act solely in the interest of the plan participant and his beneficiary; and (2) to act with the care, skill, prudence, and diligence under the circumstances then prevailing that a prudent person acting in a like capacity and familiar with such matters would use in the conduct of an enterprise of a like character and with like aims.
- 4. In accord with 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(2), Plaintiffs seek to obtain relief for the financial losses incurred as a result of the Defendants' breaches of fiduciary duty.
- 5. In accord with 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(3), Plaintiffs seek to obtain equitable relief for Defendants' breach of fiduciary duties.

Jurisdiction and Venue

- 6. This Court has original jurisdiction over the federal claim described in Paragraph I pursuant to 29 U.S.C. § 1132(e)(1).
- 7. Venue is proper in this district pursuant to 29 U.S.C. § 1132(e)(2) because each of the Defendants may be found in this district given their actions related to Mr. Rosenberg's benefits and Plaintiffs' claim for benefits and as detailed in this Complaint, Defendants' breaches of ERISA occurred in this district.
- 8. Venue is also proper in this district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391 because Defendants systematically and continuously do business in this district, and a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claims asserted herein occurred within this district.

- 9. Personal jurisdiction over Defendants exists because Plaintiff Audray Rosenberg is a Massachusetts resident who has been deprived of her rights under ERISA due to Defendants' actions.
- 10. Personal jurisdiction over the Defendants lies under 29 U.S.C. § 1132(e)(2), which provides that "process may be served in any . . . district where a defendant resides or may be found." Each of the Defendants may be found in Massachusetts, among other potential states for service, given their actions in this state related to the plan, Mr. Rosenberg's employment and benefits, and their actions related to Plaintiffs' claim for benefits.

Parties

- 11. Plaintiff Audray M. Rosenberg ("Mrs. Rosenberg") is an individual with a residence in Boston, Massachusetts.
- 12. Mrs. Rosenberg's husband Manuel B. Rosenberg ("Mr. Rosenberg"), now deceased was a fully vested participant in the Federated Department Stores, Inc. Retirement Income and Thrift Incentive Plan ("RITI"). Therefore, the Estate of Manuel B. Rosenberg brings this action as well.
- 13. Mrs. Rosenberg was the beneficiary of, *inter alia*, a 10 Year Certain & Life Annuity (the "RITI Annuity") purchased on behalf of her deceased husband, Manual B. Rosenberg, under the RITI through his employer, the Filene's division of Federated Department Stores ("Federated").
- 14. Upon information and belief, Defendant Macy's, Inc. ("Macy's") (the successor to Federated) is incorporated in Delaware with a usual place of business at 151 West 34 Street, New York, New York.

- 15. Upon information and belief, Defendant MetLife, Inc. ("MetLife") is an annuity and life insurance product provider incorporated in Delaware with a usual place of business at 200 Park Avenue, New York, NY.
- 16. Upon information and belief, Defendant Brighthouse Financial ("Brighthouse") is an annuity and life insurance product provider incorporated in Delaware with a usual place of business at 11225 North Community House Road, Charlotte North Carolina.
- 17. The Federated Department Stores, Inc. Retirement Income and Thrift Incentive Plan (the "Plan") at issue is an employee pension benefit plan regulated by ERISA. The insurer in this matter is Defendant Brighthouse.
- 18. Upon information and belief, at all times relevant, Defendant Macy's was the Plan Sponsor and was responsible for the operation of the Plan. Upon information and belief, Defendant Macy's acted as a fiduciary and in the role of plan sponsor for the Plan.
- 19. Upon information and belief, Defendant MetLife acted as a fiduciary and in the role of plan administrator for Plan.
- 20. Upon information and belief, Defendant Macy's is registered to conduct, and does regularly transact and solicit business, in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, including but not limited to entering into contracts, including for the provision of annuities, required under the terms of the Plan.
- 21. Upon information and belief, Defendant MetLife is registered to conduct, and does regularly transact and solicit business, in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, including the sale and issuance of annuity contracts of the type at issue in the instant matter.

4

{13749/A0571138.1}

22. Upon information and belief Defendant Brighthouse is registered to conduct, and does regularly transact and solicit business, in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, including the sale and issuance of annuity contracts of the type at issue in the instant matter.

Facts

- 23. Mr. Rosenberg was an employee of Federated from 1957, until he left Federated in or about October 1973.
 - 24. Macy's is the successor in interest to Federated.
- 25. Mr. Rosenberg left Federated in 1973, by which time he was a fully vested participant with an unpaid balance in the Plan. Mr. Rosenberg continued to be a participant in the Plan after leaving Federated.
- 26. At that time, Mr. Rosenberg was paid an amount equal to his own contributions to the Plan (and investment earnings attributable thereto) in the fall of 1973. Exhibit A.
- 27. Mr. Rosenberg's remaining balance at that time in the Plan of \$44,642.58 was used as the purchase premium for the RITI Annuity at issue in the instant litigation. Exhibit A.
- 28. Federated's annuity purchase form was signed by Mr. Rosenberg on February 20, 1974. Exhibit A.
- 29. Federated's representative signed the form on March 3, 1974 and a stamped acknowledgement of the form's receipt by Connecticut General Life Insurance Company (now known as "Cigna") bears the date March 6, 1974. Exhibit A.
 - 30. Upon information and belief, the Plan is currently being administered by MetLife.
- 31. Upon information and belief, the RITI Annuity is now being serviced by Brighthouse. Exhibit B.

- 32. Upon Information and belief, in August of 2017, MetLife completed the separation of a substantial portion of its U.S. Retail business, which is now operating as Brighthouse. Brighthouse is now a separate, publicly traded company comprised of three issuing insurance companies, which were formerly part of the MetLife enterprise. Exhibit C.
- 33. On or about, June 14, 2019 Brighthouse Financial confirmed that the RITI Annuity payment of \$44,642.58 was applied on November 1, 1973, with a monthly benefit of \$1,468.43 to commence on the normal retirement date of May 1, 1995. Exhibit B.
- 34. On or about, June 14, 2019 Brighthouse Financial stated that the RITI Annuity was canceled on June 1, 1990. Exhibit B.
- 35. Upon information and belief, neither Macy's, Brighthouse nor Metlife has provided proof of any notice informing Mr. Rosenberg that the RITI Annuity was going to be cancelled or replaced.
- 36. Upon information and belief, neither Macy's, Brighthouse nor Metlife provided a reason for the alleged cancellation of the RITI Annuity.
 - 37. The annuity payments from the RITI Annuity should have begun in May of 1995.
- 38. Upon information and belief, neither Mr. Rosenberg nor Plaintiff, as beneficiary, have received any payments from the RITI Annuity.
- 39. Mr. Rosenberg's tax returns for 1995 and subsequent years are consistent with the fact that he did not receive any payments from the RITI Annuity.
- 40. As of the filing of this complaint the Defendants have been unable to produce any records of payment of the RITI Annuity.
- 41. As of the filing of this complaint the Defendants have been unable to produce copies of Form 1099-R issued to Mr. Rosenberg or copies provided to the IRS.

- 42. Upon information and belief, neither Mr. Rosenberg nor Plaintiff ever cancelled the annuity or so instructed any of the Defendants.
- 43. Plaintiff has demanded payment of the benefits in correspondence submitted to the relevant Defendants on multiple occasions and has exhausted all her administrative remedies under the Plan. Exhibit D.
- 44. To the extent any further requirements for seeking administrative remedies may be asserted by Defendants, such requirements are futile; were substantially complied with if not fully complied with; and are deemed exhausted given the facts of this matter, current regulations governing claims processing under ERISA plans, and Defendants' failure to provide timely notice of appropriate and legally binding claim procedures.

A. Defendants' Breaches Of Fiduciary Duty

- 45. Under ERISA, a person who (i) asserts discretionary authority or control over the management of the plan, (ii) authority of control over plan assets, or (iii) any discretionary authority or control over plan administration is a fiduciary. 29 U.S.C. §1002 (21)(A). Defendants MetLife and Brighthouse, therefore, are each a fiduciary of the Plan due to their actions alleged above. Defendants MetLife and Brighthouse have asserted control over plan assets and have administered and managed the Plan as alleged above, rendering each a fiduciary for purposes of ERISA.
- 46. Further, as the employer and plan sponsor, Defendant Macys is a fiduciary of the Plan for purposes of ERISA.
- 47. ERISA imposes strict fiduciary duties of loyalty and prudence upon Defendants as fiduciaries of the Plan. According to the Department of Labor ("DOL"), the "primary responsibility of fiduciaries is to run the plan solely in the interest of participants and beneficiaries and for the exclusive purpose of providing benefits and paying plan expenses."

- 48. ERISA §404(a)(1) states, in relevant part, that: [A] fiduciary shall discharge his duties with respect to a plan solely in the interest of the participants and beneficiaries and -
 - (A) for the exclusive purpose of:
 - (i) providing benefits to participants and their beneficiaries; and
 - (ii) defraying reasonable expenses of administering the plan.

29 U.S.C. §1104(a)(1).

- 49. The duty of loyalty requires fiduciaries to act with an "eye single" to the interests of plan participants. Pegram v. Herdrich, 530 U.S. 211, 235 (2000). "Perhaps the most fundamental duty of a [fiduciary] is that he [or she] must display . . . complete loyalty to the interests of the beneficiary and must exclude all selfish interest and all consideration of the interests of third persons." Id. at 224.
- 50. In addition to a duty of loyalty imposed on Plan fiduciaries, ERISA also imposes a duty of prudence. The duty of prudence "imposes a "prudent person" standard by which to measure fiduciaries' investment decisions and disposition of assets." Fifth Third Bancorp v. Dudenhoeffer, __ U.S. __, 134 S. Ct. 2459, 2467 (2014) (citation omitted). This means that ERISA fiduciaries must discharge their responsibilities "with the care, skill, prudence, and diligence" that a prudent person "acting in a like capacity and familiar with such matters would use." 29 U.S.C. §1104(a)(1)(B).
- 51. Here, Defendants did not take even minimal steps to meet their fiduciary duties under ERISA. Defendants, as noted above, have unilaterally allowed for the cancellation and denial of benefits owed to the Plaintiffs. Defendants had ultimate control over the RITI Annuity and disbursements of the RITI Annuity benefits.

8

52. As ERISA fiduciaries, therefore, with all attendant fiduciary obligations,

Defendants were required as a matter of law to provide Mr. Rosenberg and Plaintiff Audray Rosenberg, as beneficiary, the retirement benefits due under the Plan and the RITI Annuity. Defendants did not.

- 53. Defendants failed to comply with their fiduciary duties of prudence and loyalty, and, in particular, have mismanaged the retirement account at issue with the sole intent of evading their obligations under ERISA.
- 54. Among other violations and breaches, Defendants have failed to manage the retirement account of Mr. Rosenberg and Plaintiff Audray Rosenberg, as beneficiary, for the exclusive purpose of providing benefits to Plan participants. In fact, Defendants have engaged in conduct intended to prevent the provision of benefits to Plaintiffs. Defendants have breached their duty of loyalty to Plaintiffs in this respect.
- 55. Further, by failing to provide the retirement benefits required by the annuity, Defendants have failed to administer the Plan consistent with its governing documents. Defendants have thereby violated their fiduciary obligations.
- 56. The Defendants' conduct, described above, has violated, and continues to violate, the sub-sections of ERISA that govern the behavior of a fiduciary.
- 57. Pursuant to ERISA §§502(a)(2) and (a)(3), and 409(a), 29 U.S.C. §§1132(a)(2) and (a)(3), and 1109(a), Defendants are liable to disgorge all profits made as a result of Defendants' breaches of fiduciary duty and are personally liable for the monetary losses attributable to Defendants' breaches of fiduciary duty.

Count I (Claim for Denial of Benefits, to Enforce Rights and Clarify Rights Under ERISA §502(a)(1)(B))

58. Plaintiffs incorporate and re-allege the foregoing paragraphs by reference as

{13749/A0571138.1} 9

though fully set forth herein.

- 59. Plaintiffs brings this Count I pursuant to ERISA § 502(a)(1)(B), 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(1)(B), which allows a participant or beneficiary to bring claims to recover benefits due under a plan, to enforce rights under the terms of the plan, or to "clarify his [or her] rights to future benefits under the terms of the plan."
- 60. Defendants owed fiduciary duties to Mr. Rosenberg, as Plan participant, and to Plaintiff Audray Rosenberg as Plan beneficiary.
- 61. Plaintiffs and Mr. Rosenberg completed all steps and actions required to receive the annuity benefit and to obtain payment of said benefit, but Defendants have denied Plaintiff Audray Rosenberg's claim for those benefits.
- 62. Plaintiffs are entitled to an order that Defendants pay the amount of those benefits to Plaintiffs, along with interest, attorney's fees and any other related damages.

Count II (Claim for Breach of Fiduciary Duty Under ERISA §§404, 409 and 502(a)(2))

- 63. Plaintiffs incorporate and re-allege the foregoing paragraphs by reference as though fully set forth herein.
- 64. Plaintiffs brings this Count II pursuant to ERISA § 502(a)(2), 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(2), which allows a participant or beneficiary to bring claims for appropriate relief for violation of the fiduciary duties imposed by ERISA in ERISA §§ 404 and 409, 29 U.S.C. §§ 1104, 1109.
- 65. Pursuant to ERISA §409, 29 U.S.C. § 1109, "Any person who is a fiduciary with respect to a plan who breaches any of the responsibilities, obligations, or duties imposed upon fiduciaries by this subchapter shall be personally liable" to make good any such losses.

- 66. ERISA § 404(a)(1), 29 U.S.C. § 1104(a)(1), provides in pertinent part that a fiduciary shall discharge his duties with respect to a plan solely in the interest of the participants and beneficiaries and:
 - (a) for the exclusive purpose of: providing benefits to participants and beneficiaries; and defraying reasonable expenses of administering the plan;
 - (b) with the care, skill, prudence and diligence under the circumstances then prevailing that a prudent man acting in a like capacity and familiar with such matters would use in the conduct of an enterprise of a like character and with like aims . . . [and]
 - (c) in accordance with the documents and instruments governing the plan insofar as such documents and instruments are consistent with the provisions of this [title I of ERISA] and title IV.
- 67. Defendants' actions have violated the obligations imposed on them by ERISA § 404, 29 U.S.C. § 1104.
- 68. As a result of Defendants' breach of fiduciary duties, Plaintiffs have suffered damages in the amount of the policy, lost earnings and interest on that amount, attorney's fees and any other losses, harms or damages.

Count III (Claim for Equitable Relief pursuant to 29 U.S.C. § 502(a)(3) Against All Defendants)

- 69. Plaintiffs incorporate and re-allege the foregoing paragraphs by reference as though fully set forth herein.
- 70. ERISA § 502(a)(3), 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(3), provides that "A civil action may be brought . . . by a . . . participant [or] beneficiary (A) to enjoin any act or practice which violates any provision of this subchapter or the terms of the plan, or (B) to obtain other appropriate equitable relief (i) to redress such violations or (ii) to enforce any provisions of this subchapter or

{13749/A0571138.1} 11

the terms of the plan."

- 71. As a result of Defendants' breach of fiduciary duties, Plaintiffs have suffered damages in an amount equal to the benefits that otherwise would have received under the Plan.
- 72. As a result of Defendants' breach of fiduciary duties, one or more of the Defendants have retained funds that they would have otherwise been legally required to pay to Plaintiffs or Mr. Rosenberg, and have wrongly profited as a result.
- 73. Defendants' breach of its fiduciary duties caused actual harm, injury and loss to Plaintiffs, and such harm cannot be remedied absent equitable or remedial relief, as the Court may deem necessary.
- 74. Pursuant to ERISA § 502(a)(3), 29 U.S.C. § 1132(a)(3), Defendants must disgorge, or be surcharged, for the value of the retirement benefits owed under the Plan and the RITI Annuity that have been wrongfully retained by them.

Count IV (In the Alternative, for Breach of Contract)

- 75. Plaintiffs incorporate and re-allege the foregoing paragraphs by reference as though fully set forth herein.
- 76. Should the Court conclude that the Plan is not subject to ERISA, then, in the alternative, Defendants, by their conduct described above, have committed breaches of contract.
- 77. Defendants are liable for breach of contract and must be ordered to pay all sums that should have been paid to Plaintiffs or Mr. Rosenberg and all lost earnings due to Defendants' failure to timely due so.

Prayer for Relief

WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs respectfully demand that judgment enter in favor of Plaintiffs against Defendants, plus interest, reasonable attorneys' fees, court costs, and such other equitable or remedial relief as the Court may deem appropriate under the circumstances.

Respectfully submitted,

Estate of Manuel Rosenberg and Audray M. Rosenberg

By their attorneys,

/s/ Stephen D. Rosenberg Stephen D. Rosenberg, Esq. [BBO# 558415] Caroline M. Fiore, Esq. [BBO# 558088]

The Wagner Law Group, P.C. 99 Summer Street, 13th Floor Boston, Massachusetts 02110

Tel: (617) 357-5200 Fax: (617) 357-5250

Email: srosenberg@wagnerlawgroup.com Email: cfiore@wagnerlawgroup.com

Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that the foregoing document filed through the ECF system will be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) and paper copies will be sent to those indicated as non-registered participants on this 15th day of October, 2020.

/s/ Stephen D. Rosenberg

Date: October 15, 2020

Exhibit A

	and the second	
I. Contractholder		line and
federated department stores, inc.		GR1122
2. Division (Name and address) 1:120209 0, 1:20 Vanishington 3000 Euroon, 1200	62.03	
3. Annuitant's Name Laured D. Geschiery	da. Sex 3b. Date of La25,30	Birth Sc. Evidence Examined 3d. Sqc. Sec. No. (See Reverse - Show No.)
ad. Annukanc's Address 305 Builtoy Eben Escalation Woode Callo		
4. Form of Annuity Elected	1000	E moores
10 Years Certain and Life Annuity	oine and Survivor	Annulty with Reach of Legaler
☐ Full Cash Refund Annuity ☐ Life Annuity (no death benefit)	C 100% C 66 ck on	i 2/3% Dipn 25 or gero
4a. Joint Angulernt's Name		Birth 4d. Evidence Examined 4e. Relationship
(necessary only if J & S Agnulty elected)		(Sec Reverse - Show No.1)
4c. Joint Annuitant's Address		
		(he
5. Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples of preferred wording)		
Arisov Becomberg, villa, il cursiving Tousai cursiving oblicates of the East	englisticul eda upo el scoçicli	er objective ord
(Ludwey Concrete C.C. Co Alp-26-villy)		
5n. Deneficiary's Address	t it is	
909 Dudloy Street, Drostilino, Hoosed	masees 02146	
6. Premium Applied to Purchase Annuity Ga. Annuity	6b. Annuity	Ge. Approx. Amount No. Annulty
Purchase Date	Commencement Date	The state of the s
12.1.73	5-2-61	\$1.448.450
12.4.73		B. Employer has given Annultant tax letter .
7. Malling instruction (need not complete unless different from 3d)		B. Employer has given Annultunt tax letter
7. Mailing instruction (need not complete unless different from 3d)		8. Employer has given Annultant tax letter
7. Mailing instruction (need not complete unless different from 3d) FRIED IN BUDGHLEFF Chapolo Fit and Markot Carones Flancial state for 1545		B. Employer has given Annultunt tax letter
7. Mailing instruction (need not complete unless different from 3d) FREEL IN ENDIRENT Chrocks Fith and limited Chroses Flancinisting far 1545	beauty reflects data as shi	8. Employer has given Annultant the letter No Ba. If no, give amount of Annultant's contributions contained in 6. 9a. Date 9a. Date par on the records of Federated Department above named Annultant for nealestance in
7. Mailing instruction (need not complete unless different from 3d) [[1] [1] [2] [2] [2] [2] [2] [2] [2] [2] [2] [2	beauty reflects data as shi	8. Employer has given Annultunt tax letter Yes No Ba. If no, give amount of Annultunt's contributions contained in 6. 9a. Date 9a. Date syn on the records of Federated Department above named Annultunt for nealestance in
7. Mailing lostruction (need not complete unless different from 3d) FIGURE 13. Experiment, Charles 13. Experiment, FIGURE 13. Experiment 1	brately reflects data as she pittle supplied to us by the the terms of the Plan and	8. Employer has given Annultunt tax letter Yes No Ba. If no, give amount of Annultunt's contributions contained in 6. 9a. Date 9a. Date syn on the records of Federated Department above named Annultunt for nealestance in

ORIGINAL AND PREMIUM TO GROUP PENSION DEPARTMENT CONNECTICUT-GENERAL-LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY HARTFORD, CONNECTICUT

REC'D. MAR 6 1974

	77 . OO '*	: 110CO	NAL VAZ	D. d.s.	out 1 F	:lad 10/1	E/20 De	1C	-£ 01		A 13
						iled 10/1		_			
FEDERATED DEPARTME	NT STORE	s, INC	- RETIREN	IENT INC	OME AND	THRIFT IN	CENTIVE	LAN - 1	rust NC), 427	01
SECTION 1 - TO DE COMPLETED	BY DIVISI				= 44					_	
_c	. Doath	REASC		NSACTION (I	Transfer	opriate box)	к.	Name or	L. Change of		(0)
(5)) 	ow Name Address		i to	Gonoral fo	s Gonorst H. Payment H.	- Sigtiromant	Acct. (S	No. Change how New	Invastment Bufpra	М. С	Other
B. Termination of Be A. Withdrawal of Employment. of Sayings "Low-Vested" "Co	Hader D	. Normal E.	Sarka Com	id in Cash I	nd in Cosh & Stock	Paymont Pe	N Inonemia	o Or Acct.	Nothel Buttement	116	plain idar
			illainèire le	ו נ.ס.ח.וא רו	.о.я.ы []	Account D	iaability "Ci	mnienta"[_		nonts'') 3
_ <i>_</i>		BUTION (Put	v la sägran				u	Ц		35	<u>s</u>
. 10 Yours					80 Y	12					
and tile 2. Life Survivor	4. Full Cash Rotund	Sum	6. Lump Sum (A	7. Instalme (Explain Di	ndar iExoloi	other (8	Manu		osember	g	
Annuity Annuity Annuity	Αησύιγ	-	lash & Slack	_		ponts")	C_02	Namu of 6226349	Porticipant	Den	- 37
	□ 2362	.50 /a				(E	21		or of Particl		
Savings not herotofora withdra	WII V.		urrent Your			st Your)	10.73		Of Ot Parishes	pant	
Mailing Address for Distribution				the div		ision (il	2.5	of Transpor	tion	
	4444	.07 002 0	HA C/C	MIO WY	Taron		d)				
Mailing Address for Form W-2P	Manager E	1/00)	F-the enest	يس والسماد	مرم والمارات	-	Chock bo	intered lette	e # Hor Bog	ייוס ויי	la la l
Maiting Agaress for Form W-2P Already noted above, Form W-21				c.baur a ow	B tenings	unioss (e	₁ <u>1.26</u>	.30			
and Market Sta. Phi	ladelph	in Pa	IV (BIOTH		19 73				toxcopt for	KI	
T .	Oto 1	Br E	PE 105			(1			dato jexcep	For Ki	
COMMENTS: VESTED TERM	MOTTAN	OF RMPL	OYMENT.	Pay on	m savin	de la	12		Onto land-	it ibe m	•
14:114:44 and accretic								yours of rec	ular employ	mont to	,
14,642,585 deferred our	uity			CO			າ]				~~
	***	T		120.	5			No. or IHS	No. of Payo	e or	r
AVIVA	7-7-7-6-7	G BA	1-73.FAT	ACT	ION-	(1			of plan parti		տ ը
	LIALY	<u>n nu</u>	Alan.						ret of plan pa		
11 . //		-1-P	7	24			-		L		 }
Dulling Dert	ر سال	40 II.	73 Fij	lene¹s							1
Avisional Authorized Stona	turo C	Date		Divis	ion iii	Dir	visional Autho	rized Signo	tujo	Dt	ole -
SECTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Th	né RITI Adr	ninistrative	Committee	n directs a	nd authoria	rag		k: Al	T.		i i
th	e transacti	on Indicate	ad on this	e directs a form: Unli e, by signing	ess otherw	isa			Roprosentuti	VO.	
at	the time o	of death, pr	orticipant v	Mas not a u	esident of	the	U	115	73		4
េង	ate of Illin	315.					MS	C	Dato	12	
Remarks:	47.00								7 42 42		
								-3¢	3362		7
SECTION III - COMPUTATION:	Employe'	e Savinac f	17.2	81.10.	+ 236	2.50 =	19.64	2.60			
THE FIRST NATIONAL BAN	K OF CHIC	AGO: TRJ:	STEE TAXPA	YER #38-80	19239	180		27.00		2000	
			CENEDAL.	TRUST FUND			GENERAL EMPLOYES	REFUND OF		VERAL	
	R					TALS	DEPOSIT	CURRENT		MENT DND	
13.4			(Sha) (3)			(4) (0)	(4) (7)	SAVINGS (6) (8)		(Sha)	(10)
I. Participant's Gredits 6 72		3931.56		1167.69		5098-25		7			
					10		1312111	11	111/4		
ll, Participant's Credite 9 Ill. Valuo Adjust. on GTF. 9/73 GEDF,&Curr.Svpn.e						1387.19	1191.89	61.59			
IV. Current Dividends 0 27_						253.27		200	1/2	ñ	
V. Past Dividends o					10mm . m	750.42		55.75	-	├	
VI. Stock # 15- pn //5//3				 	(939.02)	38927.8				 	10.
VII. Stock o to			<u> </u>							-	
VIII. GEDF Special Goy't. Fund [X.Surrandored Croults a b/o/y				T		15%			11	1	
X. Distributable Credits				 	-0-	14642,58	14050-37	7424.09			
1				-	U.S.	7		. 554	\$1.31	U	100
,D)U						Cosh 6 71	117.04				
XI. Amount of Distributions Cost	1 0		0 apal .		Total (Cosh 6/_	114-12	. She, of St	ock#	-0-	
SECTION IV - CERTIFICATION I	BY TRUSTEE		N DIRECTED		Date		Ūγ		EFF.		
											

INSTRUCTIONS & DISTRIBUTION: See RIT! Divisional Manuel. Division should complete section 1, retain white copy and mail other copies to H.O. Leave first and second carbons intact.

FRANK'S PRINTING OF THE COMPLETE FORM WITH TYPEWRITER OR BALL POINT PEW • PRINT FIRMLY AND LEGISLY

COMPLETE FORM WITH TYPEWRITER OR BALL POINT PEW • PRINT FIRMLY AND LEGISLY

Exhibit B



Brighthouse Financial 11225 N Community House Rd Charlotte, NC 28277–1234 p (980) 949 4208 sjohnson35@brighthousefinancial.com

June 14, 2019

The Wagner Law Group Stephen J. Migausky 99 Summer Street, 13th Floor Boston, Massachusetts 02110

Re: Demand for Payment

Group Annuity Benefit for Manuel B. Rosenberg

Group Name: Federated Department Co. Brighthouse Complaint Number CC2830

Dear Mr. Migausky:

I am writing in response to your letter dated May 16, 2019 addressed to MetLife regarding the above referenced group annuity benefit on behalf of the estate of Manuel B. Rosenberg. It's your contention that Mr. Rosenberg did not receive any benefit payments, prompting your request for the Company determine the status of this annuity benefit. I have been assigned to respond to your inquiry and submit the following information for your review.

After research, we have determined that this annuity benefit was issued on September 1, 1973. An initial payment of \$44,642.58 was applied on November 1, 1973, with a monthly benefit of \$1,468.43 to commence on the normal retirement date of May 1, 1995. However, records show that this benefit was canceled on June 1, 1990.

We hope that this information brings you closer to resolving this inquiry. Should you need anything further, please feel free to contact me directly.

Sincerely,

Shaun Johnson

Senior Compliance Associate

Exhibit C



PO Box 8211 Mason, Ohio 45040

October 31, 2018

THE WAGNER LAW GROUP Russell A. Gaudreau Jr. 99 Summer Street 13th Floor Boston, MA 02110

Re: Macy's, Inc. Retirement Program

Dear Russell A. Gaudreau, Jr.:

Our records show that a deferred annuity was purchased from The Travelers Insurance Company at the time of Manuel Rosenberg's termination. This was in accordance with the rules of the Federated Retirement Program at that time.

Monthly payments were scheduled to commence May 1, 1995.

For further assistance, or for a copy of the annuity contract, you should contact:

MetLife (formerly The Traveler's Life and Annuity) PO Box 14710 Lexington, KY 40512-4710 1-800-638-5656

When contacting them you should refer to Federated Department Stores, Inc. Group Contract #2646/GR1122, Certificate #31.

If you have any additional questions or concerns, I can be reached at 513-754-9418.

Sincerely,

Phillip Hale

Macy's HR Services

Ellen Stone

From: Johnson, Shaun <sjohnson35@brighthousefinancial.com>

Sent: Tuesday, September 24, 2019 1:04 AM

To: Ellen Stone Cc: Stephen Migausky

Subject: Re: [EXT]Manuel B. Rosenberg; Brighthouse Complaint Number CC2830

Hello Miss Stone, it has come to our attention that you inquired about contract for Manuel Rosenberg. As referenced in my prior email from June 21, 2019, we have no record of such contract.

Shaun Johnson Senior Compliance Associate 11225 North Community House Rd, Charlotte, NC 28277 sjohnson35@brighthousefinancial.com

From: Johnson, Shaun

Sent: Friday, June 21, 2019 8:40:00 AM

To: Ellen Stone <EStone@wagnerlawgroup.com>

Cc: Stephen Migausky <SMigausky@wagnerlawgroup.com>

Subject: RE: [EXT] Manuel B. Rosenberg; Brighthouse Complaint Number CC2830

Good morning Ms. Stone,

Allow me to offer you a little background.

This contract was originally issued by Travelers Life & Annuity Company ("Travelers") in 1973. In 2005, MetLife acquired Travelers which included its pension business along with the administrative systems used to service the contracts. The name of the issuing Company was changed to MetLife Insurance Company of Connecticut ("MICC"). In November of 2014, MICC changed its name to MetLife Insurance Company USA. In August of 2017, MetLife completed the separation of a substantial portion of its U.S. Retail business, which is now operating as Brighthouse Financial, Inc. is now a separate, publicly traded company comprised of three issuing insurance companies, which were formerly part of the MetLife enterprise. One of the issuing companies is now Brighthouse Life Insurance Company (Formerly MetLife Insurance Company USA).

As the acquisition included the administrative systems, we have visibility into the status of contracts that pre-date MetLife's acquisition of Travelers. In this case, the system shows this contract was canceled in 1990, which was 15 years before MetLife acquired Travelers. Therefore, this contract was not serviced by MetLife or Brighthouse, nor do we have the records needed to answer your questions below.

It's not uncommon for plan sponsors (the employer in many cases) to cancel certain benefits provided in a plan and replace them with another product with another financial institution. We are unable to determine if that was the case here, but it may be something to consider as you continue your research.

I hope this helps. I'm happy to discuss further if needed.

Regards,



Shaun Johnson Senior Compliance Associate 11225 North Community House Rd, Charlotte, NC 28277

Exhibit D

Case 1:20-cv-11860-MLW Document 1 Filed 10/15/20 Page 23 of 31

THE WAGNER LAW GROUP

99 SUMMER STREET, 13™ FLOOR BOSTON, MA 02110 Tel (617) 357-5200 Fax (617) 357-5250

www.wagnerlawgroup.com

800 CONNECTICUT AVE., N.W., SUITE 810 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20006 Tel (202) 969-2800 Fax (202) 969-2568

7108 FAIRWAY DRIVE, SUITE 125 PALM BEACH GARDENS, FL 33418 Tel (561) 293-3590 Fax (561) 293-3591

300 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 600 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104 Tel (415) 625-0002 Fax (415) 358-8300 190 S. LASALLE ST., SUITE 2100 CHICAGO, IL 60603 Tel (847) 990-9034 Fax (847) 557-1312

> 25 W. MOODY AVENUE ST. LOUIS, MO 63119 Tel (314) 236-0065 Fax (314) 236-5743

101 E. KENNEDY BOULEVARD, SUITE 2140 TAMPA, FL 33602 Tel (813) 603-2959 Fax (813) 603-2961

October 25, 2018

Macy's HR Services PO Box 8211 Mason, OH 45040

Re: Demand for Payment

Dear Sirs:

This is a demand for payment of retirement benefits on behalf of the estate of Manuel B. Rosenberg which is represented by this firm. Mr. Rosenberg, who died on June 15, 2017, was an Executive Vice President of the Filene's division of Federated Department Stores ("Federated") with respect to which Macy's is a successor in interest. Mr. Rosenberg left Filene's in 1973 to become the Chief Executive Officer of Gimbel's in Philadelphia, at which time he was a participant with an unpaid balance in the Federated Department Stores, Inc. Retirement Income and Thrift Incentive Plan ("RITI").

The enclosed RITI forms show that Mr. Rosenberg was paid an amount equal to his own RITI contributions (and investment earnings attributable thereto) in the fall of 1973. The remaining balance of \$44,642.58 was to be used as the purchase premium for a life annuity, payable monthly commencing May 1, 1995 which would have been the first month after Mr. Rosenberg attained age 65. Federated's annuity purchase form (copy enclosed) was signed by Mr. Rosenberg on February 20, 1974. Federated's representative signed the form on March 3, 1974 and a stamped acknowledgement of the form's receipt by Connecticut General Life Insurance Company (now known as "Cigna") bears the date March 6, 1974.

Mr. Rosenberg never received any payments related to the RITI annuity which should have begun in May 1995. His tax returns for 1995 and subsequent years are consistent with this fact and his files do not include any examples of IRS Forms W2-P or 1099-R relating to annuity

¹ This firm also represents Audray Rosenberg, Mr. Rosenberg's surviving spouse, who is listed as a beneficiary on the annuity purchase form.

Macy's HR Services October 25, 2018 Page 2

payments under the RITI or, for that matter, any payments whatsoever from Federated, Macy's or Cigna. We are not aware of whether CIGNA's obligations as the agent of Federated (and of Macy's as Federated's successor) were affected by the subsequent sale of certain portions of Cigna's life insurance operations to Lincoln National Corporation, but we can state that Mr. Rosenberg's files do not include records of payments from Lincoln National. We note that there is no indication that the RITI's liability to Mr. Rosenberg was assigned to Connecticut General or that he, in fact, consented to such an assignment or would have been willing do so.

Peter Rosenberg, Mr. Rosenberg's son, initiated correspondence with Macy's HR Services ("Macy's HR") with respect to his father's annuity. By letter dated January 17, 2018, Macy's HR informed the younger Rosenberg that "After a thorough review of our Plan records, we have determined that Manuel Rosenberg received payment of all pension funds after ending service with the company." We deem this to be non-responsive to Peter's inquiry, given that it does not indicate whether Macy's HR located anything whatsoever in its records relating to Mr. Rosenberg or his annuity.

Based on this firm's extensive experience advising retirement plan administrators on their fiduciary and recordkeeping responsibilities, we note that the Plan would have issued Forms 1099-R to Mr. Rosenberg and the IRS on an annual basis and should have retained copies of these forms. Even if some these forms had been destroyed pursuant to Macy's record retention policies, the forms for recent years would still exist. Moreover, the actuarial records of the RITI (or a successor plan) would have carried a liability with respect to Mr. Rosenberg, and if the liability had been satisfied or reduced at any point, the actuarial records and balance sheet accrued liabilities would have reflected this.

We urge Macy's to undertake a more diligent process and effort to determine the status of Mr. Rosenberg's RITI annuity. If a satisfactory answer is not forthcoming, we will consider all available actions to ensure a proper resolution, including judicial review of Macy's retirement plan procedures and engagement with regulators.

Sincerely,

Russell A. Gaudreau, Jr.

RAG/krk Enclosure

Case 1:20-cv-11860-MLW Document 1 Filed 10/15/20 Page 25 of 31

Macy's HR Services October 25, 2018 Page 3

bcc: Peter N. Rosenberg, Esq.
Stephen J. Migausky, Esq.
(each by e-mail, w/ encl.)



99 Summer Street, 13th Floor Boston, MA 02110 Tel. 617-357-5200 www.wagnerlawgroup.com

May 16, 2019

By Certified Mail No.: 7018 1830 0000 3179 9995
Return Receipt Requested

MetLife Annuity and Retirement Services PO Box 14710 Lexington, KY 40512-4710

Re: Demand for Payment

Dear Sirs:

This is a demand for payment of retirement benefits on behalf of the estate of Manuel B. Rosenberg which is represented by this firm. Mr. Rosenberg, who died on June 15, 2017, was an Executive Vice President of the Filene's division of Federated Department Stores ("Federated") and as such was a participant in the Federated Department Stores, Inc. Retirement Income and Thrift Incentive Plan ("RITI"). Through the course of our dealings with MetLife, we understand that RITI is currently being administered by MetLife.

As described in further detail below, Mr. Rosenberg, as a participant in RITI, was to receive a life annuity commencing May 1, 1995. We believe that Mr. Rosenberg has never received payments related to such annuity; and having been alerted to MetLife's administration of the RITI by Federated, we have contacted MetLife on several occasions regarding this annuity. However, we have never received a definitive response from MetLife. Most recently, Ms. Williams (from MetLife) contacted us on March 14, 2019 to confirm that MetLife is administering RITI and is conducting research into the annuity due to Mr. Rosenberg. Yet, as of the date of this letter, and notwithstanding our repeated follow-up efforts, we have not heard anything further.

By way of background, the enclosed RITI forms show that Mr. Rosenberg was paid an amount equal to his own RITI contributions (and investment earnings attributable thereto) in the fall of 1973. The remaining balance of \$44,642.58 was to be used as the purchase premium for a life annuity, payable monthly commencing May 1, 1995 which would have been the first month after Mr. Rosenberg attained age 65. Federated's annuity purchase form (copy enclosed, which was previously furnished to MetLife) was signed by Mr. Rosenberg on February 20, 1974. Federated's representative signed the form on March 3, 1974 and a stamped acknowledgement of

¹ Telephone calls were made to MetLife on February 4, 2019; March 13, 2019 and April 23, 2019

MetLife May 16, 2019 Page 2



the form's receipt by Connecticut General Life Insurance Company (now known as "Cigna") bears the date March 6, 1974. MetLife is understood to have assumed responsibility of the runoff of this business.

Mr. Rosenberg never received any payments related to the RITI annuity which should have begun in May 1995. His tax returns for 1995 and subsequent years are consistent with this fact and his files do not include any examples of IRS Forms W2-P or 1099-R relating to annuity payments under the RITI or, for that matter, any payments whatsoever from Federated, Macy's (Federated's successor) or Cigna (issuer of the RITI annuity).

Based on this firm's extensive experience advising retirement plan administrators, such as MetLife, on their fiduciary and recordkeeping responsibilities, we note that RITI would have issued Forms 1099-R to Mr. Rosenberg and the IRS on an annual basis and should have retained copies of these forms. Even if some these forms had been destroyed pursuant to MetLife's record retention policies, the forms for recent years would still exist. Moreover, the actuarial records of the RITI (or a successor plan) would have carried a liability with respect to Mr. Rosenberg, and if the liability had been satisfied or reduced at any point, the actuarial records and balance sheet accrued liabilities would have reflected this.

We insist that MetLife, as plan administrator, undertake a more diligent search process and effort to determine the status of Mr. Rosenberg's RITI annuity. If a satisfactory answer is not forthcoming, we will consider all available actions to ensure a proper resolution, including judicial review of MetLife's retirement plan procedures and engagement with regulators.

Sincerely,

Stephen J. Migausky

Enclosure

cc: Stephen W. Gauster, Esq.

(by U.S. Mail, w/encl.)

MetLife Annuity and Retirement Services
(by email, w/encl.)

² This firm also represents Audray Rosenberg, Mr. Rosenberg's surviving spouse, who is listed as a beneficiary on the annuity purchase form.

Contractholder	<u> </u>	15 THE 1			
FEDERATED DEPARTME	NT STORES, INC.			GR1122	1.00
Division (Name and address)			. 4	GRILLE	
allogor, 186 Vallegton a	tee Conten, Ikon.	63.01 63.01	- 10 mm		
Annuitpet's Name		32. Sex 35. D	nte of Bitth 3c.	Evidence Examined 13d. Sq Reverse - Show No.1	c. Stc.
thused of tracestary		ជ រូមន	5.30 See	Reverse - Show No.1 CEO-	22.67
Annultune's Address 300 Bulley Ston Deceleday,	1922+ 6539Q				
Form of Appulty Elected [] 10 Years Certain and Life Assuri	ity	☐ 100;;	irvivos Annulty w 13 66 2/3% C tele one aniv) *	ipn Exployments 25 or a	ero
Life Anaulty (no denth beneilt)	1.1.1.1	continuation	io designated s	niatant [15] Podo (17)	
Joint Annulcont's Name (accessory only if J & S Annulty elected)	L.	46. Sex (c, D	ace of Birth 44.	Evidence Examined 4e. Ri	elaciona
			50 V25		
Joint Annuicont's Address					
	galvierzo 96 . Sioù eda 20 es	the Perthel Lecone in	prati ot oqual suc	kentulco eko kentulco eko	
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Araboy Beneradore, veloa, Foresid cumpsivelay okalida (Ludrey Charmader Gada Voa	galvierzo 96 . Sioù eda 20 es	che Restdel Lebsselan	dia leopo	levigo de Leo, le any.	
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Arabitary Bellembard, calla, Tandral canadard balls Hose (Ladray Canadard balls Hose Beneficiary's Address	- ard-se-production of the contraction of the contr	nk scaesok	odoay eita	invides the	
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Arcivory Governoring office (Arcivory Canadiania office) (Arcivory Canadiania office) Beneficiary's Address JOS Dudlor Strees, Drop	gelvivezz - Algeben - Algeben	noster 021	aja leopo Sia	eccile any.	
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Androy Gondandong, value formativing oidling (Ladrey Controlly Galls Vos - Veneficiary's Address 309 Builloy Shaqon, Droo Premium Applied to Purchase Annuity	de conviving the of the fact of the fact of the open factors of the open factors of the open factors of the open	Commencement	OGOAL SIC	ecip le any.	
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Androv Boundboug, value Tordal convenience balls for examples (Ladrey Liberatory Balls for examples Heneficiary's Address 309 Budloy Surgon, Enco Premium Applied to Purchase Annulty 1 4 1 1 1 2 1 1	dC conviving the of the Part December The of the Part The of the off	skeepede in	Oldale Ge. Appre	ex. Amount No. Annuity	
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples ARRIVE BENEFICIAL CARRESTANT CARLS (Ladrey Legentance Galls Mos - Beneficiary's Address JOS Divilor Streets Dance Complete unles Mailing Instruction (need not complete unles	dC conviving the of the Part December The of the Part The of the off	Commencement	Oldale Ge. Appre	er. Amount No. Annuicy	
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Archive Bournbourg, valid, Torsini currentlying oldlish (Ladrey Leaching) Gade Hose Beneficiary's Address JOS Budloy Streets, Deco Premium Applied to Purchase Annuity And Annuity	dC conviving the of the Part December The of the Part The of the off	Commencement	OJOAL Sita Date Ge. Appro	Eccip IC Any. E. Amougt No. Angulty The bas given Angultans in	łó'
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Archardy Boundary, valid, Toronal cumpativiting official (Ladrey Linchlood Dads Hose Heneficiary's Address JOH Builloy Surgon, Drop Premium Applied to Purchase Annuity A Salid Salid Surgon Mailing lostruction (need not complete unles Carred to Reconstruct Carred to Reconstr	dC conviving the of the Part December The of the Part The of the off	Commencement	OJOAL Sita Date Ge. Appro	er. Amount No. Annuicy	łó'
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Arcivory Boundary, 1282, Control Convenience Dade Non- Control Convenience Dade Non- Beneficiary's Address JOS Divilor Street, 1200 Premium Applied to Purchase Annuity And Convenience Complete unles Convenience Complete Complete unles Convenience Complete Complete unles Convenience Complete Complete Complete unles Convenience Complete Complet	dC conviving the of the Part December The of the Part The of the off	Commencement	OJOAL Sita Date Ge. Appro	er has given Annultung to Yes amound of Annultung to surface to surface the surface of the surfa	łó'
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Arabitary Barandary, valid, Tarried Conveniency also valid, (Ladrey Lagendary Galls Ros - Beneficiary's Address JOS Budlay Saraas, Drop Premium Applied to Purchase Annuly And Annuly Malling lostruction (need not complete unle Elizability File and Lindian Conveniency	dC conviving the of the Part December The of the Part The of the off	Commencement	OJOAL Sita Date Ge. Appro	Eccip IC Any. E. Amougt No. Angulty The bas given Angultans in	łó'
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples A 2010 PROCESSION CARACTERS CARE CARACTERS CARACTERS CARE HOS HOS HOS HOS HOS BUILDES SURCORS DECO Premium Applied to Purchase Annulty A 14	AC CHARLET PART THE OF CLAP PART THE OF CLAP PART THE OF CLAP PART FOR Annulty Purchase Date 11.1.71 THE OF CLAP PART THE OF CLAP P	Consider O21 Commencement Comme	OJOAR Sita Date G. Appro	et has given Annultunt in give a mount of Annultunt in 6.	192
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Architon Beneficiary Delicity Construct Construction Calls Construction Calls Balls Bos Bos Beneficiary's Address JOS Divisory Structure, Dalls Bos Brailing Calls Brailing	all convenients all of the Part all of the Part all of the Part filting theodor far Annaly Purchase Date 11.1.73 cas different from 3d) cas different from 3d)	PAGE STEE STA	Date oc. Appro	ex. Amount No. Annuity ox. Amount No. Annuity ox bas given Annuitant to give amount of Annuitant butions contained in 6. ox bate cecords of Federated Dipar	19.7
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Arabitary Barandary, valid, Tarried Conveniency also valid, (Ladrey Lagendary Galls Ros - Beneficiary's Address JOS Budlay Saraas, Drop Premium Applied to Purchase Annuly And Annuly Malling lostruction (need not complete unle Elizability File and Lindian Conveniency	all convenients all of the Part all of the Part all of the Part filting theodor far Annaly Purchase Date 11.1.73 cas different from 3d) cas different from 3d)	PAGE STEE STA	Date oc. Appro	ex. Amount No. Annuity ox. Amount No. Annuity ox bas given Annuitant to give amount of Annuitant butions contained in 6. ox bate cecords of Federated Dipar	19.7
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Architon Beneficiary Delicity Construct Construction Calls Construction Calls Balls Bos Bos Beneficiary's Address JOS Divisory Structure, Dalls Bos Brailing Calls Brailing	CONTROL PART CO	PAGE STEE STA	Date oc. Appro	ex. Amount No. Annuity ox. Amount No. Annuity ox bas given Annuitant to give amount of Annuitant butions contained in 6. ox bate cecords of Federated Dipar	19.7
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Architon Beneficiary Delicity Construct Construction Calls Construction Calls Balls Bos Bos Beneficiary's Address JOS Divisory Structure, Dalls Bos Brailing Calls Brailing	all convenients all of the Part all of the Part all of the Part filting theodor far Annaly Purchase Date 11.1.73 cas different from 3d) cas different from 3d)	PAGE STEE STA	Date oc. Appro	ex has given Annulture to yes bas give amount of Annulture to butions contained in 6. 22. Once the following the following contained in 6. 23. Once the following the following authorized.	19.7
Beneficiary (see reverse side for examples Aradrov Bourndowy, villa, Torsini cumpativity of 153, Chadrey Legentaries Galls Mos - Beneficiary's Address JOH Budloy Sargon, Droot Premium Applied to Purchase Annuity Annui	CONTROL PART CO	PAGE STEE STA	Date oc. Appro	ex has given Annulture to yes bas give amount of Annulture to butions contained in 6. 22. Once the following the following contained in 6. 23. Once the following the following authorized.	19.7

	D BY DIVISIO				-				-	
¥0	C. Ocath	REASO	N FOR TRA	NSACTION (Put X in appr	opriete box)	_			
[5 	now Name Address		F.	Translet to	. Transfer 2 General Payment H	la fint i romànt	Acçi	Name of No. Change	L.Change of Investment Sulpro	
B. Termination of E	Benoticiary	Normal_E.	Fact F	nymont fo	ind in Cash	from J	. IOISIAND NSI	nd of Accl.	N GI Inn (M. Othe (Explai
or savinds TrempostedC	Crimonis") Ret	Intoment Rot	habdut [& Stock IN.A.D.)	Paymont P Account D	etablith "C	o, Under	Ret Framust Date	"Comment
		□.								*3
METHO	OD OF DISTNIBI	UTION (Put	X in approp	riste boat				-	_	33
10 Yanta	4. Full Cosh									
ind Life 2. Life Survivor	Ratund	Sum	Sun in	7. Instalm (Explore U "Conspor	onta lExplai	Other in Under (i	a) Kanu	el B. R	osenber	g
Annulty Annulty Annulty	Αησυιγ		ash & Stock	_	ts''l ''Com	monta")			Phricipant	_
	□ _{Nin 8} 2362 •	50 	u		4	82° (Pl	6226349		
vings not horotofore withdro			urrant Yao			st Your)			or of Partici	րող։
aiting Address for Distributi	on: Saylng	za md a	corati	DEB C/O	the div	deion (., 10.1	5-73		
	Annult	by cort	if. c/o	the dia	vision		E	factive date	al Transport	lion
					47		d)			ſ
Illing Address for Form W-2F	Mormarly Fo	ra: 10991.	Enter perti	cimat's a	on Reidense	uslaca	chack bi	istered lette	Ferm 11 file	vi or.
ready noted above. Form W-2				c/o (Mm)	Bles 6	th (n h.26	. 30		_
and Market Sta., Ph	iladel phi	in. Pa.	·4 (010414					Date of Birtl	Inscabi tot	KI
	75		1.5			(1	n <u>lı3 v</u>	P8.		
INICHER, STRONGS COM	*********		÷		,	1.0	Ago	on officilism	dato jorcan	t for K)
MMENTS: VESTED TERM	THYLTON C	DR KWATT	TANKNI.	Pay or	n savin	BD (el	70.		4
11749 And accreti	ONS 1 made	HATALY	ballan	on to be	paid in	D. EL	Total	Notting der	diat outlon	mant to
VELYING UEL HEALT	Dail 124			∜ }}		((h] [n]			
				NA			\$	באו זם נפא ב ופובחכור	No. of Paya	e or
RYALF	CECTATI	G BA	THAT?	ACT	ION-	{) Ecs or	Mote Assis	of plan parti	cipation
	FF F B B A	G Di	Alan.				Less	than 5 year	st of plan pa	rtielpātlo n
// //			<u> </u>				<u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>			
L. 10. 3.11	10	T. TE Ob	72 E4.	Lene¹s						
pyvotonal Authorized Sign	<u></u>	Date	<u> </u>							
Albu				T 4444	40-			-1 1 C1		
	- 7/E			Divis			visional Autho	kited Sibus	luia	Onla
	- 7/E		Committee				violenel Autho	rized Signal	luia J	Onlo
CTION II - TO TAUSTEE: T	he BIT! Admi he transaction plad, the Com	inistrativo n Indicate	tocantati w	directs of	ess otherw	105 180	Victorial Author	ti i sti	lyia J. Roprosenwir	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T	he RITI Admi he transactio loted, the Con it the time of	inlatrativo on Indicate malttee Rep I deoth, no	tocantati w	directs of	ess otherw	105 180	Visional Autho	ti i sti	J	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T	he BIT! Admi he transaction plad, the Com	inlatrativo on Indicate malttee Rep I deoth, no	tocantati w	directs of	ess otherw	105 180	1	ti; fi	J	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T	he RITI Admi he transactio loted, the Con it the time of	inlatrativo on Indicate malttee Rep I deoth, no	tocantati w	directs of	ess otherw	105 180	visional Author	ti; fi	T— 13	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T	he RITI Admi he transactio loted, the Con it the time of	inlatrativo on Indicate malttee Rep I deoth, po	tocantati w	directs of	ess otherw	105 180	1	ti : file	T— Bepresentin	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T	he BITI Admi he transactio he to the Con t the time of the of Illinoi	inlatrativo in Indicale militae Rep deciti, po is.	resentativ rticipant	directs of form. Units, by signing was not a r	nd authorizes otherw g. at losts the gsident of i	tos iso ot, the	ms.	h : file Constitutes 11 5	T— 13	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T it in in in in in in in it	he BITI Admi he transactio tolod, the Con- t the time of time of Illinoi Employe's	inlatrativo n Indicate maltae Rep death, po is.	resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative re	o directs o form. Unit a, by signing was not a r	and puthorizes otherwing, extensis the estimate of i	105 180	ms.	h : file Constitutes 11 5	T— Bepresentin	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Til II IN B Tarks:	he BITI Admi he transactio tolod, the Con- t the time of time of Illinoi Employe's	inlatrativo n Indicate maltae Rep death, po is.	resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative resentative re	o directs o form. Unit a, by signing was not a r	and puthorizes otherwing, extensis the estimate of i	tos iso ot, the	12,64	ti: fix	T— Bepresentin	
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T it in	he BITI Admi he transactio tolod, the Con- t the time of time of Illinoi Employe's	inlatrativo n Indicate maltae Rep death, po is.	rticipant i	o directs o form. Unit a, by signing was not a r	and puthorizes otherwing, at losts the saidant of t	tos iso ot, the	12,64	h : file Constitutes 11 5	T- Representati Bate 3762	NO CENAL
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T it in	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont that time of illinoistate of illinoistate of illinoistate of Chica	inlatrativo n Indicate maltae Rep death, po is.	17, 2 TEE TAXPA	directs of form. United by signing was not a result of the second of the	ess otherwing, actors to the saidant of the saidant	2.50 -	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT	Controlled Contro	And Canal Ca	NO NEMAL MENT
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: T it in	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont that time of the time of	inlatrativo on Indicate maltice Rep death, po is. Savings & GD: TRUS	ricipant v	directs of form. Unit so, by signing was not a result of the second seco	ess otherwing at loss the saidant of	105 iso with the 2.50 =	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND	Controlled Contro	JA Bato 3362 GEN PAY, FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till no	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont the time of time of the time of time	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	ess otherway articles of in the seldent of interest of	2.50 =	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND	Constitute of Section Of Cuparent Savings	JA Bata 3362 GEN PAY, FU	NO NEMAL MENT
CTION 11 - TO TRUSTEE: Till no	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont the time of time of the time of time	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate indicate death, po is. Savings & GD: TRUS	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	directs of form. Unit so, by signing was not a result of the second seco	ess otherwing at loss the saidant of	2.50 =	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND	Constitute of Section Of Cuparent Savings	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION 11 - TO TRUSTEE: Till no	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont the time of time of the time of time	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	ess otherway articles of in the seldent of interest of inter	7ALS (a) (b) 5098-25	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (c) (7) (7) (2) (7) (2) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7	Contrattee 11 5 26 0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS 10 181 2342-50	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
TION 11 - TO TRUSTEE: Till no no service servi	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont the time of time of the time of time	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	ess otherway articles of in the seldent of interest of inter	(a) (b) (5078-25	12,64 GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (c) (7) 22757.4.8	Constitute of Section Of Cuparent Savings	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
TION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till no no service servi	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont the time of time of the time of time	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	ess otherway articles of in the seldent of interest of inter	(a) (b) (5078-25) (387.19) 253.27	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (c) (7) (7) (2) (7) (2) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7) (7	Contrattee 11 5 26 0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS 10 181 2342-50	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Trial in a service of the se	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Cont the time of time of the time of time	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	rnd puthoria ess otherwing, attacks the gradient of the f- 23 & 19239 To [Sha] (5) 738.02	(1) (8) (387.19 253.27 750.42	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (c) (7) 2759.48	Contrattee 11 5 26 0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS 10 181 2342-50	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till no a service of the first NATIONAL BAR II. Participant's Credity 272-1. Stock 2712-1. Stock	he BITI Admine transactio olod, the Cont the time of the cont t	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	ess otherway articles of in the seldent of interest of inter	(a) (b) (5078-25) (387.19) 253.27	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (c) (7) 2759.48	Contrattee 11 5 26 0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS 10 181 2342-50	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till no as State of the First NATIONAL BAR II. Participant's Credite of Tales Adjust on GTF 1/73 Couront Dividends 0 77 Past Dividends 0 77 Past Dividends 0 77 Stock of 1/2 on 7/5/73 1. Stock of 1/2 on 7/5/73	he BITI Admine transactio olod, the Cont the time of the cont t	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	rnd puthoria ess otherwing, attacks the gradient of the f- 23 & 19239 To [Sha] (5) 738.02	(1) (8) (387.19 253.27 750.42	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (c) (7) 2759.48	Contrattee 11 5 26 0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS (0) [B] 2342-50	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till no as Smarks: CTION III - COMPUTATION: THE FIRST NATIONAL BAP I. Participant's Credity 9 I. Participant's Credity 9 I. Value Adjust on GIF 9 V. Past Dividends 0 27 V. Past Dividends 0 27 V. Past Dividends 0 27 I. Stock 9 1 2 0 0 1 1 5 7 3 II. Stock 9 0 0 0 1 1 5 1 7 3 II. GEDF Special Gey't. Fund	he BITI Admine transactio olod, the Cont the time of the cont t	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate indicate death, po is. Savings 8 GD: TRUS	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	rnd puthoria ess otherwing, attacks the gradient of the f- 23 & 19239 To [Sha] (5) 738.02	(1) (8) (387.19 253.27 750.42	GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (c) (7) 2759.48	Contrattee 11 5 26 0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS (0) [B] 2342-50	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till and State of the	he BITI Admine transactio olod, the Cont the time of the cont t	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate indicate death, po is. Savings 8 GD: TRUS	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	to authorizes otherwises otherwises of the seldent	1.05 iso	#5 12,64 GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND 101 (7) 22759.4.8	Controlled I : fl. Controlle	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till and State of the	he BITI Admine transactio olod, the Cont the time of the cont t	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate indicate death, po is. Savings 8 GD: TRUS	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	rnd puthoria ess otherwing, attacks the gradient of the f- 23 & 19239 To [Sha] (5) 738.02	(1) (8) (387.19 253.27 750.42	#5 12,64 GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND 101 (7) 22759.4.8	Contrattee 11 5 26 0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS (0) [B] 2342-50	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till and an analys: CTION III - COMPUTATION: THE FIRST NATIONAL BAR II. Participant's Credits 9 II. Participant's Credits 9 II. Participant's Credits 9 II. Value Adust on GTF 9/73 II. Value Adust on GTF 9/73 V. Past Dividends 0 27 V. Past Dividends 0 27 V. Past Dividends 0 20 II. Stock 9 11 2 20 III. Stock 9 11 2 20 III. GEDF Special Goy't. Fund X. Surrondored Credits 4 b/c/v X. Distributable Credits	he BITI Admine transactio olod, the Cont the time of the cont t	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate indicate death, po is. Savings 8 GD: TRUS	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	to authorizes otherwises otherwises of the seldent	1.05 iso	#5 12,64 GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND 101 (7) 22759.4.8	Controlled I : fl. Controlle	JA- Riggresenturing Batto 3762 GEN PAY: FU	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till and State of the	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Constitute of the Constitute	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate militae Rep ideath, pa is. Savings 8 GD: TRUS	17, 2 TEE TÁXPA GENERAL TShat (3)	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	to authorizes otherwises otherwises of the self and of the self and of the self and of the self and the self	1.05 iso	GENERAR EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (0) (7) 22158.45	11 : - fix Contrattes - 11 5 - 16 - 3.6.0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS 101 181 2342-50 61.59	JA- Roppesentuti JA JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO J	eral Ment
CTION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till no a service of the first NATIONAL BAR II. Participant's Credits of the first NATIONAL BAR II. Participant's Credits of the first NATIONAL BAR II. Participant's Credits of the first National Service of the first Nation	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Constitute of the Constitute	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate militae Rep ideath, pa is. Savings 8 GD: TRUS	TO SENTATION OF THE TAXPA GENERAL T (Shat (3) 205,85	A directs of form. Unit so the sugaring was not a result of the su	to authorizes otherwises otherwises of the self and of the self and of the self and of the self and the self	1.05 iso	#5 12,64 GENERAL EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND 101 (7) 22759.4.8	Controlled I : fl. Controlle	JA- Roppesentuti JA JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO J	eral Ment
TION II - TO TRUSTEE: Till no a state of the	he BITI Admine transaction olod, the Constitute of the Constitute	inlatrativo in Indicate in Indicate ind	TO SENTATION OF THE TAXPA GENERAL T (Shat (3) 205,85	All directs of form. Unit form. U	to authorizes otherwises otherwises of the self and of the self and of the self and of the self and the self	1.05 iso	GENERAR EMPLOYES DEPOSIT FUND (0) (7) 22158.45	11 : - fix Contrattes - 11 5 - 16 - 3.6.0 REFUND OF CURRENT SAVINGS 101 181 2342-50 61.59	JA- Roppesentuti JA JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO JATO J	eral Ment



99 Summer Street, 13th Floor Boston, MA 02110 Tel. 617-357-5200 www.wagnerlawgroup.com

October 3, 2019

By email: sjohnson35@brighthousefinancial.com

Mr. Shaun Johnson Brighthouse Financial Senior Compliance Associate 11225 North Community House Rd. Charlotte, NC 28277

Re: Manuel B. Rosenberg; Brighthouse Complaint Number CC2830

Dear Mr. Johnson:

I am writing this letter with respect to an annuity (the "Annuity") originally issued by Connecticut General Life Insurance Company with Manuel B. Rosenberg as annuitant. We understand that due to several corporate transactions, the Annuity should now be serviced by Brighthouse Life Insurance Company ("Brighthouse"). As you may recall, in response to a letter we sent to MetLife (predecessor to Brighhouse), we received your email dated June 14, 2019 and also your letter dated June 21, 2019 informing us that the Annuity had been cancelled in 1990. However, at the same time, we also received correspondence from Annuity & Retirement Services of Brighthouse Life Insurance Company asking us to complete additional paperwork in connection with the Annuity.

As requested, we completed the additional paperwork and submitted it to Annuity and Retirement Services on June 28, 2019. During the following months, I frequently called Annuity and Retirement Services to check on the status of the claim --- on August 21, 2019 was informed that a calculations report had been produced and on September 6, 2019, was informed by Tim, that "absolutely there is a benefit due." Tim also informed me that additional benefit options were being calculated which would take approximately three to four weeks. When I called to follow up on August 28, 2019, Melissa stated that additional research was still being done. Finally, I was notified by you on September 24, 2019 in an email that Brighthouse has no record of such contract.

At this point, we would request an explanation as to why Annuity and Retirement Services requested that we provide additional information, produced calculations reports, and even informed us that a benefit was "absolutely" due only to subsequently be told that Brighthouse has no record of such contract.

Case 1:20-cv-11860-MLW Document 1 Filed 10/15/20 Page 31 of 31

Mr. Shaun Johnson October 3, 2019 Page 2



Furthermore, although your September 24, 2019 email states that Brighthouse has no record of the Annuity, your email dated June 21, 2019 states that Brighthouse records show that the Annuity was canceled in 1990. We respectfully request that you provide us copies of Brighthouse records evidencing the cancellation of the Annuity.

Thank you in advance for assisting us in researching this Annuity.

Sincerely,

Ellen D. Stone

Ellen P. Stre

cc: Russell A. Gaudreau, Jr., Esq. (by email)